

**Template for comments and secretariat observations**

Date: 2/22/6	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
--------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
	Part 7c: Roads					
Ben	7c		ge	inconsistent reference to Transportation base	change all occurrences of "Transportation Base (Part 7) part" and other forms thereof to "Transportation base (Part 7)"	AAS
Ben	7c: Introduction	lines 206-8	ed	Surpassing is in the other direction and in more than just linear events; many other standards also served as a starting point and these are not mentioned.	Delete the last sentence from paragraph 2.	AAS
Ben	7c:1	line 223	ed	wrong title	change "Road" to "Roads"	AAS
Ben	7c:1	line 223	ed	only one annex applies	change "annexes" to "annex"	AAS
Ben	7c:1	lines 241-248	ed	class names should not be used here	change "TranPoints" to "transportation points", TranPaths to "transportation paths", "TranSegs" to "transportation segments", "RoadSeg" to "roadway segment", "RailSeg" to "rail segment", and "RoadPoint" to "road point", "RailPoint" to "rail point"	AAS
Ben	7c:1	line 247	ed	wrong word – they are equivalenced by the equivalence association	change "equivalent" to "equivalenced"	AAS
Ben	7c:1	lines 241-248	ed	wrong part – this discussion belongs in Transportation base	move this paragraph to Part 7	AAS

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/6	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
--------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
Ben	7c:7		ge	<p>The following comment has been submitted against Transportation base (Part 7):</p> <p><b>Segmentation Model Change:</b> The segmentation model requires all TranSegs to terminate with TranPoints. This was stipulated to insure that the resultant set of TranSegs form a complete coverage of the transportation system without gaps or overshoots. To accommodate systems without TranPoints, the model allows TranPaths to exist without an underlying TranSeg. Feedback received indicates that some people are incorrectly using TranPaths to model the physical roadway to get around the TranPoint constraint. This defeats the agreed purpose of TranPaths as a particular USE of the TranSegs with TranSegs representing the physical roadway. This normalized view allows the physical transportation system to be defined once and then used in any number of ways.</p> <p>If accepted for Transportation base (Part 7) then the ripple affect would be to change Rail (Part 7b), Roads (Part 7c), and Transit (Part 7d) accordingly.</p>	Make start point and end point RoadPoints optional for a RoadSeg but make RoadSegs mandatory for RoadPaths. Specific changes are included below and referenced back to this general comment.	Decided in Transportation Base  AAS
Ben	7c:7.1	line 346	ed	wrong words	change “is a physical component” to “is comprised of physical components”	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.1	lines 363-4	ed	wrong place – general road features are not part of the segmentation model	move these lines to be before line 348, “The focus of...”	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.1	Figure 1	te	RoadPath.routeNumber attribute is redundant with attribute of the same name inherited from TranPath	delete RoadPath.routeNumber from the model	AAS

Type of comment: ge = general te = technical ed = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date: 2/22/6	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
--------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
Ben	7c:7.2.1	Figure 1	te	See comment 7c:7 <b>Segmentation Model Change</b> above	Change multiplicity of TranSeg side of its association with TranPath from 0..* to 1..*. Change multiplicities of TranPoint end of associations with TranSeg from 1..* to 0..* Update Table 1 accordingly: Row 9 O becomes M; rows 35 and 36 change from M to O	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.1	line 376	te	See comment 7c:7 <b>Segmentation Model Change</b> above	Change "RoadSegs are" to "It is highly recommended that RoadSegs be"	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.1	379	ed	misplaced text results in ambiguous reference	move ", such as Route 66 or Washington Avenue" to the end of the preceding sentence which currently ends with "usage of part of the road network"	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.5	Figure 3	ed	wrong caption	Change figure caption to "Road segment equivalence"	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.7	line 447	te	See comment 7c:7 <b>Segmentation Model Change</b> above	change "may be" to "shall be"	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.8	Table 1	ed	stereotypes in element rows are redundant with those in the entity rows to which they refer	for all element rows, drop the stereotype value. Ditto for table 2	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.8	Table 1	ed	ExtendedAttribute should be singularized	change "ExtendedAttributes" to "ExtendedAttribute" in Data Type column of rows 4, 15, and 27	AAS
Ben	7c:7.2.8	Table 1	te	routeNumber should be inherited from TranPath	In Name column, add "TransportationBase::TranPath::" prefix	AAS

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

**Template for comments and secretariat observations**

Date: 2/22/6	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
--------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
Ben	7c:7.2.8	Table 1	te	Equivalencies can involve whole or partial entities on either from or to end	In rows 10 and 11, change the Domain from "Unrestricted" to "Whole or partial RoadPaths".  In rows 37 and 38, change the Domain from "Unrestricted" to "Whole or partial RoadSegs".	AAS
Ben	7c:7.3.2.1, 7.3.2.2, 7.4	line 493, 505-6, Figure 6	ed	RoadPointEventType and RoadLinearEventType code lists were intended to be informative only as each data supplier will have its own set of shareable road attributes	On line 493 and 505-6, change the redundant "A non-exhaustive" to "An informative"  Add "(Informative)" at the beginning of the figure caption for Figure 6.  Add "(Informative)" at the end of the title of clause 7.4	AAS
Ben	7c:7.3.3.2	line 561	ed	missing word	Add "where" to before "the county changes"	AAS
Ben	7c:7.3.3.2	Figure 6	ed	these are code lists for attribute, not feature events	In Figure 6 caption, change "RoadPointEvent" to "RoadPointAttributeEvent" and "RoadLinearEvent" to "RoadLinearAttributeEvent".  Move figure to follow more closely clause 7.3.2 (it should precede Figure 5, necessitating figure number swapping).	AAS
Ben	7c:7.3.4	Table 2 row 47, 50	ed	When Data Type column value is a CodeList or Enumeration, the Domain is already restricted to these values (or extensions in the case of CodeList) so Domain should be "Unrestricted". As stated on rows 47 and 50, the domain says that the listed code list values cannot be extended.	Change Domain to "Unrestricted"	AAS

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

**Template for comments and secretariat observations**

Date: 2/22/6	Document: INCITS Ballot 007-06 INCITS 1574-D, Information technology - Geographic Information Framework Data Content Standards.
--------------	---

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB <sup>1</sup>	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
Ben	7c:7.4	Tables 3 and 4	te	missing Definitions		?
Ben	7c:7.4.1,2	line 570, 575	ed	code lists are non-exhaustive which is why they are not enumerations	delete the redundant "non-exhaustive" CodeList adjective	AAS
Ben	7c:7.4.1,2	line 570, 575	ed	wrong attribute names	add "Type" to end of "linearEvent" and "pointEvent"	AAS

Type of comment: **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

**NOTE** Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10